

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK**

JAMES DING, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

NEW YORK UNIVERSITY,

Defendant.

---

CHRISTIAN VARBANOVSKI, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

NEW YORK UNIVERSITY,

Defendant.

---

ETHAN SAM, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

NEW YORK UNIVERSITY,

Defendant.

---

NATHAN HIRSCH WARD, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

NEW YORK UNIVERSITY,

Defendant.

Case No.: 1:25-cv-02416-ER

Case No.: 1:25-cv-02422-AT

Case No.: 1:25-cv-02464-ER

Case No.: 1:25-cv-02495-ER

ALEXANDER THOMAS, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

NEW YORK UNIVERSITY,

Defendant.

Case No.: 1:25-cv-02500-JMF

JACKSON BUETTNER, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

NEW YORK UNIVERSITY,

Defendant.

Case No.: 1:25-cv-02503-AT

NISSIM RAM, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

NEW YORK UNIVERSITY,

Defendant.

Case No.: 1:25-cv-02510-ER

QUENTIN TURNER, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

NEW YORK UNIVERSITY,

Defendant.

Case No.: 1:25-cv-02552-ER

LIAM DUVALLY, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

NEW YORK UNIVERSITY,

Defendant.

---

AFIF TAI and JOSEPH COLLINS, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

v.

NEW YORK UNIVERSITY,

Defendant.

---

ALONDRA MARISOL LOZANO, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

NEW YORK UNIVERSITY,

Defendant.

---

JACK MINANO, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

NEW YORK UNIVERSITY,

Defendant.

Case No.: 1:25-cv-02583-ER

Case No. 1:25-cv-02595-ER

Case No. 1:25-cv-02720-ER

Case No.: 1:25-cv-02750-UA

JENNIE WHALEN, individually and on behalf of all others similarly situated,

Plaintiff,

v.

NEW YORK UNIVERSITY,

Defendant.

Case No.: 1:25-cv-02926-KPF

**STIPULATION AND ORDER TO CONSOLIDATE RELATED ACTIONS AND SET BRIEFING SCHEDULE FOR INTERIM CLASS COUNSEL APPLICATIONS**

**WHEREAS**, Plaintiffs James Ding, Christian Varbanovski, Ethan Sam, Nathan Hirsch Ward, Alexander Thomas, Jackson Buettner, Nissim Ram, Quentin Turner, Liam DuVally, Afif Tai, Joseph Collins, Alondra Marisol Lozano, Jack Minano, and Jennie Whalen (“Plaintiffs”) filed the above-captioned 13 related class action lawsuits (“Related Actions”) against Defendant New York University (“NYU” or “Defendant”) following reports of the disclosure of personally identifiable information (“PII”) in a cybersecurity incident (the “Data Incident”);

**WHEREAS**, the Related Actions present common issues of law and fact making them ripe for consolidation pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 42(a);

**WHEREAS**, Rule 42(a) provides that “[i]f actions before the court involve a common issue of law or fact, the court may: (1) join for hearing or trial any or all matters at issue in the actions; (2) consolidate the actions; or (3) issue any other orders to avoid unnecessary cost or delay.” Fed. R. Civ. P. 42(a);

**WHEREAS**, courts enjoy “broad discretion to determine whether consolidation is appropriate,” *Johnson v. Celotex Corp.*, 899 F.2d 1281, 1284 (2d Cir. 1990), and in deciding the consolidation issue, courts consider “[w]hether the specific risks of prejudice and possible confusion [are] overborne by the risk of inconsistent adjudications of common factual and legal

issues, the burden on parties, witnesses, and available judicial resources posed by multiple lawsuits, the length of time required to conclude multiple suits as against a single one, and the relative expense to all concerned of the single-trial, multiple-trial alternatives.” *Barkley v. Olympia Mortg. Co.*, 557 Fed. App’x 22, 25 (2d Cir. 2014) (quoting *Celotex*, 899 F.2d at 1284);

**WHEREAS**, this Court and other district courts within the Second Circuit routinely find that overlapping data breach class actions filed in the same court share common legal and factual issues and consolidate such cases. *See, e.g., In re GE/CBPS Data Breach Litig.*, No. 20-cv-2903 (S.D.N.Y.) (ECF No. 14); *Stewart v. Practice Resources LLC*, 2022 WL 17155996 (N.D.N.Y. Nov. 22, 2022); *Malinowski v. Int’l Business Machines Corp.*, No. 23-cv-8421 (S.D.N.Y.) (ECF No. 18); *Tuteur, et al. v. Metropolitan Opera Ass ’n*, No. 23-cv-03997 (S.D.N.Y.) (ECF No. 15).

**WHEREAS**, here, the Related Actions share common legal and factual issues, in that each of the Related Actions arise from the same Data Incident suffered by the same Defendant (NYU), are brought on behalf of similar or overlapping classes in the same court, and allege that NYU failed to adequately safeguard Plaintiffs’ and putative Class Members’ PII;

**WHEREAS**, the parties have met and conferred, and agree and stipulate, subject to Court approval, that the Rule 42(a) requirements are met here, and that it would be appropriate to consolidate the Related Actions, as this would streamline the litigation, and would not result in confusion or prejudice;

**WHEREAS**, the various Plaintiffs’ counsel who filed the Related Actions have diligently met and conferred about case leadership in this matter, but have not been able to reach an agreement on leadership, necessitating motion practice under Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(g);

**WHEREAS**, counsel for Defendant does not oppose the establishment of a Rule 23(g) case leadership briefing schedule, but Defendant takes no position on appointment of Plaintiffs’ lead counsel;

**NOW THEREFORE**, for the foregoing reasons, all the parties in the Related Actions **AGREE AND STIPULATE** as follows:

- (1) The Related Actions are appropriate for consolidation under Fed. R. Civ. P. 42(a), and shall be consolidated into the docket of the first-filed *Ding* action, No. 1:25-cv-02416.
- (2) The clerk shall administratively terminate all other Related Actions. The case file for the Consolidated Action will be maintained under Master File No. 1:25-cv-02416 (i.e., *Ding*).
- (3) Any action subsequently filed in, transferred to, or removed to this Court that arises out of the same or similar operative facts as the Consolidated Action shall be consolidated with the Consolidated Action for pre-trial purposes. The parties shall file a Notice of Related Action whenever a case that should be consolidated into this action is filed in, transferred to, or removed to this District.
- (4) If the Court determines that the case is related, the clerk shall:
  - a. Place a copy of this Stipulated Order in the separate file for such action;
  - b. Serve on Plaintiffs' counsel in the new case a copy of this Stipulated Order;
  - c. Direct that this Stipulated Order be served upon Defendant(s) in the new case; and
  - d. Make appropriate entry in the Master Docket.
- (5) Plaintiffs' counsel with existing cases may submit applications for appointment of interim class counsel (individually or as a group or slate) under Fed. R. Civ. P. 23(g). Any applications should be filed within 7 days of the Court signing and entering an Order granting this stipulation. Individual submissions are limited to 5 pages and group or slate submissions are limited to 10 pages, all exclusive of firm resumes which are the only exhibits that may be submitted along with the applications. No responses or replies are permitted.

(6) A Consolidated Class Action Complaint shall be filed within 45 days following the date of the Court's order appointing interim class counsel. Defendant need not respond to any of the individual complaints filed in any of the Related Actions. Following appointment of interim class counsel, the parties shall confer and submit for the Court's consideration an agreed-upon briefing schedule for any motion to dismiss briefing.

**SO STIPULATED BY THE PARTIES.**

Dated: June 13, 2025

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Vicki J. Maniatis

Vicki J. Maniatis (NY Bar 2578896)  
**MILBERG COLEMAN BRYSON  
PHILLIPS GROSSMAN PLLC**  
405 East 50th Street  
New York, NY 10022  
Telephone: (516) 491-4665  
vmaniatis@milberg.com

Gary M. Klinger (*pro hac vice* to be filed)  
**MILBERG COLEMAN BRYSON  
PHILLIPS GROSSMAN, PLLC**  
227 W. Monroe Street, Suite 2100  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Telephone: (866) 252-0878  
gklinger@milberg.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Ding*

/s/ Jeff Ostrow

Steven Sukert (NY Bar 5690532)  
Jeff Ostrow (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
**KOPELOWITZ OSTROW P.A.**  
1 W. Las Olas Blvd., Suite 500  
Fort Lauderdale, Florida 33301  
Telephone: (954) 332-4200  
sukert@kolawyers.com  
ostrow@kolawyers.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Varbanovski*

/s/ *Israel David*

Israel David  
Adam. M. Harris  
**ISRAEL DAVID LLC**  
60 Broad Street, Suite 2900  
New York, NY 10004  
Telephone: (212) 350-8850  
[israel.david@davidllc.com](mailto:israel.david@davidllc.com)  
[adam.harris@davidllc.com](mailto:adam.harris@davidllc.com)

*Counsel for Plaintiff Sam*

/s/ *Vicki J. Maniatis*

Vicki J. Maniatis (NY Bar 2578896)  
**MILBERG COLEMAN BRYSON**  
**PHILLIPS GROSSMAN PLLC**  
405 East 50th Street  
New York, NY 10022  
Telephone: (516) 491-4665  
[vmaniatis@milberg.com](mailto:vmaniatis@milberg.com)

Bryan L. Bleichner (*pro hac vice* pending)  
Philip J. Krzeski (*pro hac vice* pending)  
**CHESTNUT CAMBRONNE PA**  
100 Washington Avenue South, Suite 1700  
Minneapolis, MN 55401-2138  
Telephone: (612) 339-7300  
[bbleichner@chestnutcambronne.com](mailto:bbleichner@chestnutcambronne.com)

*Counsel for Plaintiff Hirsch Ward*

/s/ *Katherine M. Aizpuru*

Katherine M. Aizpuru (N.Y. Bar 5305990)  
**TYCKO & ZAVAREEI LLP**  
2000 Pennsylvania Ave., NW, Suite 1010  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
Telephone: (202) 973-0900  
[kaizpuru@tzlegal.com](mailto:kaizpuru@tzlegal.com)

Sabita J. Soneji (*pro hac vice* to be filed)  
**TYCKO & ZAVAREEI LLP**  
1970 Broadway, Suite 1070  
Oakland, CA 94612  
Telephone: (510) 254-6808  
[ssoneji@tzlegal.com](mailto:ssoneji@tzlegal.com)

*Counsel for Plaintiff Ram*

  
/s/

William B. Federman  
Tanner R. Hilton (*pro hac vice* pending)  
**FEDERMAN & SHERWOOD**  
10205 North Pennsylvania Avenue  
Oklahoma City, OK 73120  
Telephone: (405) 235-1560

4131 North Central Expressway, Suite 900  
Dallas, TX 75204  
wbf@federmanlaw.com  
trh@federmanlaw.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Thomas*

/s/ Philip M. Hines

Philip M. Hines  
**HELD & HINES, LLP**  
622 Third Avenue, Suite 600  
New York, NY 10017  
Telephone: (212) 696-4529  
phines@heldhines.com

Kevin Laukaitis (*pro hac vice* to be filed)  
Maria de los Angeles Colom (*pro hac vice* to  
be filed)  
**LAUKAITIS LAW LLC**  
954 Avenida Ponce De Leon  
Suite 205, #10518  
San Juan, PR 00907  
Telephone: (215) 789-4462  
klaukaitis@laukaitislaw.com  
mcolom@laukaitislaw.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Buettner*

/s/ Vicki J. Maniatis

Vicki J. Maniatis (NY Bar 2578896)  
**MILBERG COLEMAN BRYSON**  
**PHILLIPS GROSSMAN PLLC**  
405 East 50th Street  
New York, NY 10022

Telephone: (516) 491-4665  
vmaniatis@milberg.com

Jason M. Wucetich (*pro hac vice* to be filed)  
**WUCETICH & KOROVILAS LLP**  
222 N. Pacific Coast Highway, Suite 2000  
El Segundo, CA 90245  
Telephone: (310) 335-2001  
jason@wukolaw.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Turner*

/s/ *Gerald D. Wells, III*  
Gerald D. Wells, III (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
**LYNCH CARPENTER, LLP**  
1133 Penn Avenue, 5th Floor  
Pittsburgh, PA 15222  
Telephone: (412) 322-9243  
jerry@lcllp.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff DuVally*

/s/ *Thomas E. Loeser*  
Jonathan D. Lindenfeld, # JL1990  
**FEGAN SCOTT LLC**  
305 Broadway, 7th Floor  
New York, NY 10007  
Telephone: (332) 216.2101  
Facsimile: (312) 264.0100  
jonathan@feganscott.com

Elizabeth A. Fegan (*pro hac vice* to be filed)  
Megan A. Shannon (*pro hac vice* to be filed)  
**FEGAN SCOTT LLC**  
150 S. Wacker Dr., 24th Floor  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Telephone: (312) 741-1019  
Beth@feganscott.com  
Megan@feganscott.com

Thomas E. Loeser (*pro hac vice* pending)  
Karin B. Swope (*pro hac vice* to be filed)  
Vara G. Lyons, NY Bar 5464524  
**COTCHETT, PITRE & MCCARTHY,  
LLP**  
1809 7th Avenue, Suite 1610

Seattle, WA 98101  
Telephone: (206)-802-1272  
Facsimile: (206)-299-4184  
tloeser@cpmlegal.com  
vlyons@cpmlegal.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Tai, et al.*

/s/ *Ashley M. Crooks*

Ashley M. Crooks (N.Y. Bar No. 5800776)  
**HAUSFELD LLP**  
33 Whitehall Street, 14th Floor  
New York, NY 10004  
Telephone: (646) 357-1100  
acrooks@hausfeld.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Lozano*



/s/

Deborah De Villa (NY Bar 5724315)  
**AHDOOT & WOLFSON, P.C.**  
521 5<sup>TH</sup> Avenue, 17<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10175  
Telephone: (917) 336-0171  
Facsimile: (917) 336-0177  
Ddevilla@ahdootwolfson.com

Andrew W. Ferich (*pro hac vice* pending)  
**AHDOOT & WOLFSON, P.C.**  
201 King of Prussia Road, Suite 650  
Radnor, PA 19087  
Telephone: (310) 474-9111  
Facsimile: (310) 474-8585  
aferich@ahdootwolfson.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Minano*



/s/

Brian P. Murray (BM 9954)  
**GLANCY PRONGAY & MURRAY LLP**  
230 Park Avenue, Suite 358  
New York, NY 10169

Telephone: (212) 682-5340  
bmurray@glancylaw.com

John Yanchunis (*pro hac vice* to be filed)  
**MORGAN & MORGAN**  
**COMPLEX LITIGATION GROUP**  
201 N. Franklin Street, 7th Floor  
Tampa, Florida 33602  
Telephone: (813) 223-5505  
jyanchunis@ForThePeople.com

*Counsel for Plaintiff Whalen*

/s/ 

Eric R. Fish  
**BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP**  
45 Rockefeller Plaza  
New York, New York 10111  
Telephone: (212) 589-4200  
efish@bakerlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant New York University*

SO ORDERED:



---

HON. EDGARDO RAMOS  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

Dated: June 20, 2025

New York, NY